

**Gmail**

99+  
Mail

Tulis

260  
Kotak Masuk

Berbintang

Ditunda

Terkirim

3  
Draf

Selengkapnya

Label +

nadjib

Aktif

17 dari 17

Manuscript Submission to The Studia Regionalne i Lokalne Eksternal Kotak Masuk x

Anang Dwi Santoso <anang.d.santoso@gmail.com> kepada sril.euroreg, abdulnadjib, saya v

Kam, 19 Agu 2021, 13.39

Ingggris > Indonesia > Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris x

Dear Editor

We are interested in submitting our manuscript entitled "Social Capital, Bureaucratic Neutrality and Regional Head Election in Indonesia" to The Studia Regionalne i Lokalne. We wish this manuscript can be put into the reviewing process.

Thank you  
Regards

--  
Anang Dwi Santoso  
Junior Lecturer  
Department of Public Administration  
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences  
Universitas Sriwijaya  
Jl. Palembang - Prabumulih KM 32, Indralaya, Kabupaten Ogan Ilir,  
HP: (+62)85647319085 | Office: (0711) 580572  
Website: [fisip.unsri.ac.id](http://fisip.unsri.ac.id) | Email: [anang.d.santoso@gmail.com](mailto:anang.d.santoso@gmail.com)/[anangdwi@fisip.unsri.ac.id](mailto:anangdwi@fisip.unsri.ac.id)

Satu lampiran • Dipindai dengan Gmail

Manuscript with ...

SRIL EUROREG <sril.euroreg@uw.edu.pl> kepada Anang, abdulnadjib, saya v

Jum, 20 Agu 2021, 22.04

Ingggris > Indonesia > Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris x

Dear Mr Santoso,

thank you very much for your submission. The review procedure should take about 12 weeks. I will inform you about the results. The subsequent review procedure requires receiving from all authors of the article two pieces of information:

- 1) Please confirm that the submission of the article complies with the publishing ethics of the journal "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne" described [here](#), especially regarding the originality of the submitted article, which should not be published anywhere before or not submitted for publication in any other journal or book, regardless of on the nature of the publication and its language, in whole or partly.
- 2) Due to the requirements of the Regulation on the Protection of Personal Data (GDPR), I ask for the following consent: "I agree to the processing of my personal data for the purpose of reviewing and publishing my article in the quarterly "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne". I acknowledge that the administrator of the personal data is the University of Warsaw (ul. Krakowskie Przedmieście 26/28, 00-927 Warsaw). I have knowledge that providing data is voluntary, but necessary to achieve the purposes for which it was collected." Information clause regarding the processing of authors personal data by the Editorial Office is available [here](#):

Please reply to this email by entering the following formula  
"1) I confirm that the article complies with the publishing ethics of the journal "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
2) I agree"  
and sign with your full name.

Kind regards  
dr Dorota Celińska-Janowicz  
Sekretarz redakcji  
Kwartalnik "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
[www.studreg.uw.edu.pl](http://www.studreg.uw.edu.pl)

Anang Dwi Santoso <anang.d.santoso@gmail.com> kepada SRIL, abdulnadjib, saya v

Jum, 20 Agu 2021, 22.27

Deteksi bahasa > Indonesia > Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris x

Dear Editor

- 1) I confirm that the article complies with the publishing ethics of the journal "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"
- 2) I agree

Regards

Anang Dwi Santoso

SRIL EUROREG <sril.euroreg@uw.edu.pl> kepada Anang, abdulnadjib, saya v

Sab, 21 Agu 2021, 18.31

Deteksi bahasa > Indonesia > Terjemahkan pesan Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris x

Dear Mr Santos,  
thank you. I need to receive similar cinformations from all authors of the article.

Kind regards  
Dorota Celińska-Janowicz, PhD  
Executive Editor  
Quarterly "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
[www.studreg.uw.edu.pl](http://www.studreg.uw.edu.pl)

...



**Oemar Madri Bafadhal** <oemarmadribafadhal@fsip.unsri.ac.id>  
kepada SRiL, Anang, abdunadjib ▾

Min, 22 Agu 2021, 12.30 ☆ ↶ ⋮

Dear Editor

1) I confirm that the article complies with the publishing ethics of the journal "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
2) I agree

Regards

Oemar Madri Bafadhal

...



**Abdul Nadjib** <abdunadjib@fsip.unsri.ac.id>  
kepada saya, SRiL, Anang ▾

Min, 22 Agu 2021, 12.34 ☆ ↶ ⋮

🇺🇸 Inggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ [Terjemahkan pesan](#)

[Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris](#) ✕

Dear Editor

1) I confirm that the article complies with the publishing ethics of the journal "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
2) I agree

Regards

Abdul **Nadjib**

...

...



**SRiL EUROREG**  
Thank you. Kind regards Quarterly "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne" [www.studreg.uw.edu.pl](http://www.studreg.uw.edu.pl)

Sen, 23 Agu 2021, 00.37 ☆



**SRiL EUROREG**  
Thank you. Pozdrawiam serdecznie

Sen, 23 Agu 2021, 00.37 ☆



**SRiL EUROREG** <sril.euroreg@uw.edu.pl>  
kepada Abdul, saya, Anang ▾

Sen, 23 Agu 2021, 00.37 ☆ ↶ ⋮

🇺🇸 Inggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ [Terjemahkan pesan](#)

[Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris](#) ✕

Thank you.

Kind regards  
Dorota Celińska-Janowicz, PhD  
Executive Editor  
Quarterly "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"  
[www.studreg.uw.edu.pl](http://www.studreg.uw.edu.pl)

...



**SRiL EUROREG** <sril.euroreg@uw.edu.pl>  
kepada Anang, Abdul, saya ▾

Sen, 15 Nov 2021, 23.51 ☆ ↶ ⋮

🇺🇸 Inggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ [Terjemahkan pesan](#)

[Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris](#) ✕

Dear Authors,

After a rigorous peer-review, we have decided to ask you to revise your manuscript "SOCIAL CAPITAL, BUREAUCRATIC NEUTRALITY, AND REGIONAL HEAD ELECTION IN INDONESIA". The review reports are available below. Please prepare a cover letter to be submitted together with the revised version of your manuscript, replying to the reviewers' recommendations and the respective rebuttal in the case you disagree with any suggestion. Please provide us with the revised manuscript by 30 November 2021 with all changes made in 'track changes' mode. Please, let me know if you need more time.

I kindly ask you to confirm receipt of this email, and if you have any questions do not hesitate to let me know.

**REVIEWER 1: Accept, subject to significant revisions.**

The authors studied public administration, civil servant and social capital. In well-governed public administration State Civil Apparatus (ASN) is separated from politicians. In Indonesia decentralization of public administration make accumulation of social capital easier. It concerns the head of administration, officials and voters. However social capital is considered as a factor serves quality of governance, this paper proved that this is not in Indonesia. In spite of that, the authors showed that the decentralization considered in UE as remedy for all evil, in Indonesia conduct to diminishing the standards of good administration. This are main findings of reviewed paper - in my opinion. Something like that should be in conclusion and abstract. Abstract which I read is vague – as for me.

Looking at the whole I have mixed conclusions. Undoubtedly the paper is interesting and well written but some fragments needing attention and changes.

Fragments from the paper are in are in quotation marks. My remarks are in red.

"The relation between administration and politics will have a negative impact...."

**It doesn't fit in with another passage** "This is because the level of success (and or failure) in governance and development depends on the relation between the two

(Svara, 1998; Dunn and Legge Jr., 2002; Schuh and Miller, 2006). Thus, a good relationship between the two will strengthen the legitimacy of the government"

These statements must match. Should be - some of relations between administration and politics will have a negative

"Simply put, Bourdieu (1983) referred social capital as the benefits that are obtained from the existence of social relations, "

Social capital means social relations which can base for obtain the benefits and on the other pages the authors offers relevant definitions

"Basically, the term social capital refers to the capacity of individuals to obtain valuable material or symbolic goods based on the virtue of social....."

"considered social capital as a whole something that is directed or created to facilitate individual actions in their social structure. Meanwhile, physical capital refers to physical objects and human capital refers to individual property, in which social capital refers to the relationships between individuals, social networks, and the reciprocal norms and beliefs that arise from them (Putnam, 2000)"

Both this statement should be treated as methodological core and every fragments mentioned "social capital" must match with these definitions.

Simply put, Bourdieu (1983) referred social capital as the benefits that are obtained from the existence of social relations, such as family, office colleagues, colleagues, and relatives in general"

Unacceptable. See above definitions.

"which then grow and provide benefits for the interacting parties. In government, we argue that the social capital relation between the regional head and the State Civil Apparatus leads to the growing non-neutrality of the apparatus in regional head elections"

Accordingly to above definitions social capital means relation. And this is tautology – relation of relation.

"This study is interesting to study because the previous literature focused more on identifying forms of non-neutrality of ASN and why this phenomenon happens (Anderson and Martin, 1983; Martin, Knopoff and Beckman, 1998; Myers, 2004; Zhou, 2010), whereas this paper is targeted in a deeper space by arguing that this non-neutrality occurs due to reciprocation and the accumulation of social capital"

This study is interesting to study because - ambiguous

"Basically, the term social capital refers to the capacity of individuals to obtain valuable material or symbolic goods based on the virtue of social relations and membership in social groups or the plurality capacity of a person to be favored with the benefits of collective action based on the virtue of social participation, trust in institutions, or commitment to determining the ways in carrying out something"

This is important statement and should be written more clearly. Something like that:

1. benefits by virtue of social relations
2. benefits by virtue of own actions
3. benefits by virtue of participation in group success
4. the crucial premises for social activities is trust

Figure 1.

The box containing Relationships with groups etc. A bit ambiguous

"The strong paternalistic and/or nepotism culture that grows from the social capital relations between regional heads and ASN and their relatives is the result of the social relations of information".

Perhaps intensive or frequent communication or intensive social relations?

"culture that grows from the social capital" It not matched with knowledge about culture. Raher: first culture and nepotism and next special goals for using social capital

In this article, we discussed how incumbents use social capital as a tool to mobilize bureaucrats to increase their opportunities of being re-elected. In relation to social capital, we found that the patterns and behavior of bureaucrats and their relationship to incumbents are historically constructed.

Important and nice statement, but about "historically" there was practically nothing in the paper.

REVIEWER 2: Accept, subject to minor revisions.

Although the article is correctly based on a case study, it also contains a few substantive shortcomings. The author points to the article's contribution to the matter concerning the use of social capital in the context regional head elections. Nevertheless, the contribution of the article is quite limited for methodological reasons due to:

- the description of the research tools used is very general, it was not indicated in what period of time the observations were carried out, and how many interviews were conducted;
- the profile of the interviews was not indicated (how the concept of social capital was operationalized during the interview, what was the scope of the interviews and what was their nature);
- no justification was provided as to why specific groups of informants were covered and observed, and what were the proportions between particular categories of respondents, e.g. political party activists, candidates, local officials, etc.;
- it was not justified why a specific administrative unit was chosen as a case study, the criteria were not indicated;
- no hypotheses were defined that would organize the argumentation made in the work

Chart 1 is incomplete, I recommend to name (define) relationships: incumbents - ASN in relation to relationships and trust.

The article is recommended for publication provided that the above-mentioned issues are completed.

Kind regards

Dorota Celińska-Janowicz, PhD

Executive Editor

Quarterly "Studia Regionalne i Lokalne"

[www.studreg.uw.edu.pl](http://www.studreg.uw.edu.pl)

...

Thank you for your feedback.

Noted with thanks.

Thank you for your email.

← Balas

« Balas ke semua

→ Teruskan