

Journal of Materials and Environmental Science <jmes2015@gmail.com>

AttachmentsSun, Jun 5, 2016, 4:24 AM

to me

Dear author

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Journal of Materials and Environmental Science, " Design and experimental testing of small scale acid mine drainage treatment plant for iron, manganese, and sulfate ions removal

Our decision is to: Accepted after revision.

Please make your corrections according the referees suggestions on your manuscript by indicating your changes with red color. . Upload both doc. (revised Mns and answers to referees). Thank you to indicate in the next emails the Ref. No of your paper.

Please follows instructions of JMES (see attached file).

Thanks and regards

Zarrouk

Manuscript « Design and experimental testing of small scale acid mine drainage treatment plant for iron, manganese, and sulfate ions removal » submitted to J. Mater. Environ.

Comment:

1. Abstract: authors write « pH up to 125% ». this sentence should be corrected
2. Why the authors use reverse osmosis instead of nanofiltration? Concentration of salts is not so high and most of ions are divalent or trivalent and thus can be eliminated easily by nanofiltration
3. The numbers are not indicated in figure 1

4. table headings should be above and figure titles should be below
5. Equation 2 : the authos should explain clearly that  $(RE)_{total}(\%) = (RESF) + REUF + RERO / 3$  and not  $(RE)_{total}(\%) = (RESF) \times REUF \times RERO$
6. Methods of analysis of manganese, sulfate and iron should be briefly described in experimental section (material and method)
7. English should be revised by native speakers
8. In the light of the above remarks, the manuscript should not be accepted in its present form and thus reject with resubmission is recommended

**subriyer unsri <subriyer@unsri.ac.id>** Sun, Jun 19, 2016, 7:51 AM

to jmes2015

Dear Editor

Thank you very much for your email regarding manuscript entitled " Design and Experimental Testing of Small scale Acid Mine Drainage Treatment Plant for Iron, Manganese, and Sulfate Ions Removal". We have made some correction for the manuscript as suggested by reviewer. Herewith, please find the revision and response to reviewer in the attachment. Once again, thank you very much for you kind help.  
Best regards,

Subriyer Nasir  
Chemical Engineering Department  
Faculty of Engineering, Sriwijaya University  
Jl. Raya Palembang Prabumulih, Ogan Ilir 30662  
Indonesia

Manuscript « Design and experimental testing of small scale acid mine drainage treatment plant for iron, manganese, and sulfate ions removal » submitted to J. Mater. Environ.

Comment:

1. Abstract: authors write « pH up to 125% ». this sentence should be corrected
2. Why the authors use reverse osmosis inseed of nanofiltration? Concentration of salts is not so high and most of ions are divalent or trivalent and thus can be eliminated easily by nanofiltration
3. The numbers are not indicated in figure 1
4. table headings should be above and figure titles should be below

5. Equation 2 : the authors should explain clearly that  $(RE)_{total}(\%) = (RE_{SF}) + RE_{UF} + RE_{RO} / 3$  and not  $(RE)_{total}(\%) = (RE_{SF}) \times RE_{UF} \times RE_{RO}$
6. Methods of analysis of manganese, sulfate and iron should be briefly described in experimental section (material and method)
7. English should be revised by native speakers
8. In the light of the above remarks, the manuscript should not be accepted in its present form and thus

reject with resubmission is recommended

#### **Response to the reviewer**

1. Abstract was improved as suggested by the reviewer (Please refer to the red color of the sentence in the abstract and the content of paper)
2. We use reverse osmosis instead of nanofiltration due to various advantages such as RO able to eliminate bacteria and viruses from AMD. RO is also able to eliminate the harmful substance in the acid mine drainage. RO can be used to remove the divalent ion more than 99% compared to NF (less than 90%).
3. We have removed Figure 2 and left the scheme of experimental work Schematic of Small-scale AMD treatment plant as is.
4. Yes, we have made some corrections to the Table and Figure alignment.
5. We made the correction for Equation 2. The total removal efficiency is the average of overall system removal efficiency.
6. We used the UV 200-RS Spectrophotometer for determining manganese, iron and sulfate on both sample and permeate. Manganese, iron and sulfate were determined at wavelength of 425, 540 and 420 respectively.
7. Yes, we have checked and revised the syntax and grammar.
8. We wish to revise the manuscript as suggested by reviewers. Any considerations made by the reviewers prior to the acceptance of the manuscript will be highly appreciated.

**JMES jmes <jmes2015accepted@gmail.com>** Sun, Jul 10, 2016, 8:17 PM

to me

Dear Author

Please revise and check your Proof  
Also, check Citation of Tables and Figs in the text !!

Please Check your paper and Keep this last version

Please could support JMES by **70 to 100 Euros** see data on pageweb or sent on westerUnion = hosting + Computer Technical.

Please Check your paper and Keep this last version

**Pour les articles en Français :** Vous êtes priés de verser **1200-1900 dh** dans le compte sur la pageweb ou envoyé sur westerUnion pour frais de soutien = hébergement + technicien en Informatique

Please revise your Proof and some refs from our journals :

**Maghrebien Journal of Pure & Applied Science ISSN: 2458-715X**  
<http://revues.imist.ma/index.php?journal=mjpas>

and

**Arabian Journal of Chemical & Environmental Research ISSN: 2458-6544**  
<http://www.ajcer.com>

and

**Moroccan Journal of Chemistry ISSN: 2351-812X**  
<http://revues.imist.ma/index.php?journal=morjchem>

and

**Journal of Materials and Environmental Science (ISSN: 2028-2508)**  
<http://www.jmaterenvironsci.com/>

Welcome to ICMES2016, December 1-3, 2016, Oujda Morocco

<http://www.jmaterenvirosci.com/icmes2016>

Thanks and regards

-----  
أ.د. بلخير حموتي الإدريسي الحسني

The Editor in Chief

*Prof. Belkheir Hammouti*

**Maghrebian Journal of Pure & Applied Science ISSN: 2458-715X**

<http://revues.imist.ma/index.php?journal=mjpas>

and

**Arabian Journal of Chemical & Environmental Research ISSN: 2458-6544**

<http://www.ajcer.com>

and

**Moroccan Journal of Chemistry ISSN: 2351-812X**

<http://revues.imist.ma/index.php?journal=morjchem>

and

**Journal of Materials and Environmental Science (ISSN: 2028-2508)**

<http://www.jmaterenvirosci.com/>

Arab Award in Chemistry 2013

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RafTSjr86aY>

B.P. 4808, 60 046 Oujda Morocco

Mobile: +212 668 632 273 & +212 661 360 191; Fax: +212 536 500 603

[hammoutib@gmail.com](mailto:hammoutib@gmail.com)

<http://www.oujdacity.net/oujda-article-2178-fr.html>