



Suwandi S <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

[JIP] New notification from Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian

2 messages

Indra Purnama <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
Reply-To: Indra Purnama <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
To: Suwandi Suwandi <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

Tue, Jul 5, 2022 at 6:30 AM

You have a new notification from Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian:

You have been added to a discussion titled "10497-Revise before review" regarding the submission "Multiple infections of Ganoderma boninense somatic individuals on oil palm seedlings".

Link: <https://journal.unilak.ac.id/index.php/jip/authorDashboard/submission/10497>

Indra Purnama

[Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian](#)

Indra Purnama <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
Reply-To: Indra Purnama <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
To: Suwandi Suwandi <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

Tue, Jul 5, 2022 at 6:31 AM

You have a new notification from Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian:

There is new activity in the discussion titled "10497-Revise before review" regarding the submission "Multiple infections of Ganoderma boninense somatic individuals on oil palm seedlings".

Link: <https://journal.unilak.ac.id/index.php/jip/authorDashboard/submission/10497>

Indra Purnama

[Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian](#)



Suwandi S <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

[JIP] Editor Decision

3 messages

Indra Purnama <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
To: Suwandi Suwandi <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

Wed, Jul 20, 2022 at 10:03 PM

Dear Dr. Suwandi:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian, "Multiple infections of Ganoderma boninense somatic individuals on oil palm seedlings: Infeksi ganda individu somatik Ganoderma boninense pada bibit kelapa sawit".

Our decision is to: Resubmit for Review.

Please submit your revision before 23 July 2022.

Best regards,

Dr. Indra Purnama
Editor-in-chief
Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian

Reviewer A:

The paper reported the severity of Ganoderma infection on oil palm seedlings when artificially infected with single and multiple isolates. The paper carries new information and has the potential for knowledge advancement. The title is reflecting the content. Unfortunately, the number of isolates tested was very limited and the study cannot draw a strong conclusion. The authors are advised to revise the conclusion. The paper is well organized, however, there are a few things missing in the materials and methods section, dan the discussion is not critical enough. Other major issues are, (i) How the Ganoderma isolates used assured as G. boninense?; (ii) How does the use of 100% sand as the planting medium can support the growth of oil palm seedlings?; (iii) It's unclear how the fungal colonization was measured; and (iv) reduction of disease was related to competition of the fungal pathogens alone. How about other factors that probably caused the disease infection? The reviewer notes that Gb-A was more aggressive compared to Gb-B. When these 2 isolates were combined, they showed a reduction in infection. Can it be due to the volume of inoculum of Gb-A being reduced to half? That is why the reviewer feels that more isolates should be tested, including those with similar aggressiveness to make a stronger conclusion. The amount of data is insufficient to support the conclusion. In addition, seedlings that show symptoms were quite low (maximum of 40% for Gb-A). The paper can be considered for publication with revision on the conclusion. It's not really certain that multiple infections will cause a reduction in disease. Last but not least, the language needs to be improved. Other comments and suggestions are indicated in the manuscript.

Recommendation: Resubmit for Review

Reviewer B:

Check correction from file.

Suggestion: Author can use familiar terms, especially to describe somatic individuals. can we replace it with "strain" ?


Some sentences sometimes have no meaning, because missing an object. Sometimes, authors use the wrong words to describe something. and make the sentences ambiguous.


Please check the English to the expert

Recommendation: Revisions Required

[Jurnal Ilmiah Pertanian](#)

2 attachments

 **A-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709_Reviewed.docx**
546K

 **B-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709.docx**
2280K

Suwandi S <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>
To: suwandi saleh <suwandi.saleh@gmail.com>


Fri, Jul 22, 2022 at 1:56 PM


[Quoted text hidden]

--

Suwandi, Ph.D.
Phytopathology Laboratory, Department of Plant Protection
Faculty of Agriculture, Sriwijaya University
Jl. Palembang-Prabumulih Km.32 Indralaya 30662 Indonesia
Tel./Fax. +62-711-580663 E-mail: suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id

2 attachments

 **A-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709_Reviewed.docx**
546K

 **B-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709.docx**
2280K

Suwandi S <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>
To: suwandi saleh <suwandi.saleh@gmail.com>


Fri, Jul 22, 2022 at 2:11 PM


----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Indra Purnama** <indra.purnama@unilak.ac.id>
Date: Wed, Jul 20, 2022, 10:04 PM
Subject: [JIP] Editor Decision
To: Suwandi Suwandi <suwandi@fp.unsri.ac.id>

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments

 **A-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709_Reviewed.docx**
546K

 **B-10497-Article Text-37885-1-4-20220709.docx**
2280K