



[IJG] Editor Decision: Resubmit

2 pesan

Tjahyo Nugroho Adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>

20 Mei 2019 pukul 08.54

Kepada: Mrs Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

Cc: mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id

Dear Mrs. Maya Fitri Oktarini,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the Indonesian Journal of Geography (IJG), "The Role of River Ways in The Spreading of Vernacular Architecture in South Sumatra, Indonesia". After thoroughly reading your manuscript, we decided to give you a chance to resubmit. The quality of your manuscript at its current form did not meet IJG standard. However, you are allowed to resubmit your manuscript to our journal after major improvement by expanding the manuscript and rewriting of the content. We will wait for your resubmission no later than 120 days from now.

Comments:


- The first time we say thank you for submitting this unique and interesting manuscript to the IJG, and the uniqueness of the topic in this manuscript has never been published by the IJG. However, before we continue this manuscript to the reviewer, there are a number of things that need to be corrected, given that the IJG is a Q-3 journal that has a broad scope of readers internationally.
- In language, this manuscript needs to be checked (in English) by a native speaker or by someone who is capable and accustomed to writing well and correctly, before being submitted again. I found many idiomatic and grammatical errors, typo (s), as well as some unknown terms in English terminology (maybe this could be explained more clearly in the article). There are still terms in Indonesian.
- Abstract, authors should look at some journal articles and pay attention to how to write an abstract. In our opinion, the abstract begins with a little background and the main purpose of this study, followed by a detailed summary of the methodology, and then the results include conclusions. In the results or conclusions section (in the abstract), authors should highlight the specific findings of this study which are (or) the answers to the objectives of the study; In the abstract, you must explain the detailed summary of the study so that the research objective can be achieved
- Introduction. Things written in this section are too basic (general information) and less specific which are directly related to the research objectives. References in this section are very minimal and need to be added with publications that have similar topics. At the end of the introduction, it needs to be included (in a strict sentence), the specific purpose of this paper
- The method is still very general and has not explained the analysis of what was conducted so that the objectives of the research can be achieved (less detailed and firm). In short: the methodology delivered is still not detailed (please see how to write methodologies in publications that have been published in reputable journals)
- Figure 5 (map). Because this is a geography journal, please complete a map such as X and Y coordinates, inset, orientation, map scale, etc. (You can ask for help with someone who understands the field of mapping)
- In the discussion section, suggestions are provided to revise the manuscript and make it of broader interest to the global geo-architect community, instead of the manuscript is a local case study. One way is to compare the results of this study with cases (publications) that are the same / almost the same (house architects) that are controlled by the physical condition of the area in several places in the world.
- Conclusions are OK (there are findings), but it needs to be compared with similar cases in various places in the world, because IJG is an international journal and so that the scale of the reader can be broader and not impressed by site specifics.

Please carefully respond to comments when resubmitting your manuscript, and please clearly indicate the changes that you made (or highlight them) to address reviewer's comments. Or, you can directly reply to comments in the comments box written by the reviewer. You can also use the template attached below. We will not process any revised paper without a specific response to each reviewer's comments.

I hope this decision does not discourage you to submit your paper to our journal in the future. Thank you.

Best wishes,
 Tjahyo Nugroho Adji
 Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada
 Phone 62-8122967492
 Fax 62-589595
adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id
 Section Editor
 Indonesian Journal of Geography
 Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta

Chief Editor
Indonesian Journal of Geography
<http://jurnal.ugm.ac.id/index.php/ijg>
0024-9521 (print), 2354-9114 (online)
Phone: +62 812-2711-480

 **comment_arsitek_river.docx**
17K


Maya Fitri Oktarini ft <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>
Kepada: Tjahyo Nugroho Adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>

9 Juli 2019 pukul 22.07

Dear Mr. Tjahyo Nugroho Adji ,
I resubmitted my revised paper. I made several revisions according to the editorial review. Hopefully, my paper can meet the standards of writing Indonesian journal of geography and be accepted for the next review process.

My regards,

Dr. Maya Fitri Oktarini
Lecturer of Architecture Program in Universitas Sriwijaya
Phone 081367616761
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

 **43923-121433-1-SM rev 05 (Rev) - perbaikan.docx**
852K



Dr. Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

[IJG] Editor : Ask more reviewer list

1 pesan

Tjahyo Nugroho Adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>

23 Juli 2019 pukul 07.30

Kepada: Mrs Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

Dear Mrs. Maya Fitri Oktarini

Regarding your manuscript, which is in the process of finding reviewers,
Can you help us by sending two names as reviewers of your manuscript?
(provided that the two reviewer names already have Scopus id);

For information, from the three names that you sent before, only one person
has Scopus id (Sugeng Triyadi) and until now has not agreed /is
willing/reply to review your manuscript.

Thank you

Best wishes,
Tjahyo Nugroho Adji
Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada
Phone 62-8122967492
Fax 62-589595
adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id
Section Editor
Indonesian Journal of Geography
Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta

Chief Editor
Indonesian Journal of Geography
<http://jurnal.ugm.ac.id/index.php/ijg>
0024-9521 (print), 2354-9114 (online)
Phone: +62 812-2711-480



Dr. Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

IJG: ask new reviewer list

2 pesan

tjahyo nugroho adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>
Kepada: mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id

23 Juli 2019 pukul 07.33

Dear Mrs. Maya Fitri Oktarini

Regarding your manuscript, which is in the process of finding reviewers,
Can you help us by sending two names as reviewers of your manuscript? (provided that the two reviewer names already have Scopus id);

For information, from the three names that you sent before, only one person has Scopus id (Sugeng Triyadi) and until now has not agreed/is willing/reply to review your manuscript.

Thank you

Section Editor Indonesian Journal of Geography
Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta

Tjahyo Nugroho Adji, Dr. MSc.Tech (Associate Professor)
Karst Groundwater and Hydrogeochemistry
Dept. of Environmental Geography
Gadjah Mada University, Jogjakarta, Indonesia
SCOPUS ID = **54987826800**
<http://tjahyo-adji.staff.ugm.ac.id/>
<https://adji.academia.edu/>
Ph. +62-274-589595
+62-8122967492

Maya Fitri Oktarini ft <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>
Kepada: tjahyo nugroho adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>

25 Juli 2019 pukul 13.03

Dear Mr. Tjahyo Nugroho Adji,

I regret the difficulty of information about the list of reviewers I submitted. I re-submitted the three substitute names as a reviewer. I have confirmed their willingness to review my paper and the index of Scopus ID. Thank for the opportunity for me to publish the research in your journal. The following is the name of the reviewers :

Soesilo Kusdiwanggo (<https://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.uri?authorId=57197842460>)
kusdiwanggo@ub.ac.id

Ari Siswanto (<https://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.uri?authorId=57208312119>)
ari_sisw58@yahoo.co.id

Widya Fransiska (<https://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.uri?authorId=57197843800>)
widyafriansiska@ft.unsri.ac.id

Best Regards,

Dr. Maya Fitri Oktarini, S.T., M.T.
Lecturer
Dept. Architecture
Universitas Sriwijaya
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**[IJG] Editor Decision: Revision Required**

1 pesan

Tjahyo Nugroho Adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>

2 September 2019 pukul 06.42

Kepada: Mrs Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

Dear Mrs Maya Fitri Oktarini,

After considering reviewer's comments (see the attachment in your OJS account), We have reached the decision to Accept your manuscript with major revision regarding your submission to Indonesian Journal of Geography, "The Role of River Ways in The Spreading of Vernacular Architecture in South Sumatra, Indonesia".

Here under the reviewers comments:

Reviewer B

1. The definition of vernacular architecture has not been well explained in order to avoid misconceptions with other architectural understandings, such as traditional architecture.
2. Explanation of data collection should be more detailed. Moreover, this research is not bound by administrative areas, but culturally.
3. The GIS methodology does not appear to be used in identifying landscape characteristics of the movements; and natural accessibility in spreading the community that has been promised. It should be shown how to stack the stacking of map layers through GIS.
4. Before entering the discussion section, it should be demonstrated how the data analysis process is based on GIS to find the results.
5. The results of the analysis should reflect the analytical method used. Therefore, the results are more geographical / architectural landscape than architectural details (type and variant).
6. The discussion section also does not reflect the position and role of geography. The discussion should be enriched by referring and accommodating literature review.
7. Conclusions are more or less in accordance with the objectives of the study, but it is not explained how the function of geography helps strengthen the conclusions, how the spreading of both types of vernacular architecture and the history of the settlement are explained through GIS.

Reviewer D

1. The topic of the paper is considered as a piece of unique information on Indonesian architecture treasure. It can describe the treasure from the upstream to the downstream of the Musi River in South Sumatera. The potential strength of this paper is the description of the spread of the architecture along the river by using GIS analysis to explain the development or transformation of typology. However, the paper is failed to explain in clear and concise what and how the GIS analysis being used in this study. The explanation of the spread of typology in figure 5 is only showing the places of those vernacular architectures as well as the ethnics.
2. This is quite important since the GIS analysis is the strength and interesting point mentioned in the abstract. As stated, "The geographic information system was used to analyze influences of the linkages of the river ways, the spreading of the ethnic group, the typologies of architecture, and its transformation". Moreover, this GIS analysis is the focal point. It reflects how this paper fit to be published in IJG. The evidence of the GIS analysis is quite a lack in explaining the methodology then the results.
3. Paper also mentions the analyses of the house transformation are done by comparing the architecture with the original type. However, the comparison is not clearly shown in the manuscript. The paper only shows the illustration of the original type of houses and only describes the transformation in words. The statement in subsection 3.3, line 1 and 2 : "... experiencing transformation in the room size and partition, the roof material and shape, the opening number and size, and the ornaments." is not showed in the body text as well as illustration. Actually this transformation analysis (based on again GIS analysis process) is the strength of this paper. Unfortunately, the author is weak in explaining the process of transformation as well as the results (variant 1 to 4).

Please also see the attachment

You should improve the quality of your manuscript by revising your manuscript according to the reviewer's comments. Please carefully respond to reviewer's comments when submitting the revision and please clearly indicate the changes that you made (or highlight them) to address the reviewer's comments. Or, you can directly reply to reviewer's comments in the comments box written by the reviewer. You should also use the template attached below. We will not process any revised paper without a specific response to each reviewer's comments

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Indonesian Journal of Geography and I look forward to receiving your revision no later than 60 days from now (until 2 November 2019). If you failed to meet the deadline, we may have to consider your paper rejected.

NB: Please use the follow the guideline in the attached template for your revision.

Best wishes,
Tjahyo Nugroho Adji
Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada
Phone 62-8122967492
Fax 62-589595
adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id
Section Editor
Indonesian Journal of Geography
Faculty of Geography, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta

Chief Editor
Indonesian Journal of Geography
<http://jurnal.ugm.ac.id/index.php/ijg>
0024-9521 (print),2354-9114 (online)
Phone: +62 812-2711-480

 **comment_from_reviewer B.docx**
2109K



Dr. Maya Fitri Oktarini <mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id>

IJG: your manuscript

1 pesan

tjahyo nugroho adji <adji_tjahyo@ugm.ac.id>
Kepada: mayafitrioktarini@ft.unsri.ac.id

25 November 2019 pukul 08.54

On 2 September 2019 we sent an e-mail to (via the IJG system) about the revised manuscript "The Role of River Ways in The Spreading of Vernacular Architecture in South Sumatra, Indonesia" from you. Actually your revised manuscript was due on November 2, 2019 so we had to delete it from the system. However, we still give a chance until December 2 to improve the manuscript, as suggested by the reviewers. We are waiting for this before December 2, 2019.

To improve the manuscript, please see how in the two attachments that we sent with this email.

IJG Section editor,

Tjahyo Nugroho Adji, Dr. MSc.Tech (Associate Professor)
Karst Groundwater and Hydrogeochemistry
Dept. of Environmental Geography
Gadjah Mada University, Jogjakarta, Indonesia
SCOPUS ID = **54987826800**
<http://tjahyo-adji.staff.ugm.ac.id/>
<https://adji.academia.edu/>
Ph. +62-274-589595
+62-8122967492

2 lampiran **example_respond_to_rev.pdf**
111K **example_rev_time_series_pindul_jan_2019.doc**
4516K