

**BUKTI SEBAGAI REVIEWER  
ARTIKEL JURNAL INTERNASIONAL BEREPUTASI**

Judul artikel : The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic

Jurnal : Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition ([Q1](#), SJR 0.64)

Penulis : Paul, Subrata; Prank, Md.; Tabassum, Mushfika; Sultan, Nahid; Islam, Shilpi; Hossain, Md

No	Perihal
1	Undangan mereview
2	Persetujuan mereview
3	Submitt hasil review
4	Keputusan editor
5	Sertifikat



asep ali &lt;asepali76@gmail.com&gt;

---

## Invitation to Review for the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition

---

Jürgen Hummel <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Mon, Nov 14, 2022 at 4:34 PM

Reply-To: jhummel@gwdg.de

To: asepali76@gmail.com

Cc: jhummel@gwdg.de

14-Nov-2022

Dear Mr. Ali:

We recognise that the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic may affect your ability to return your review to us within the requested timeframe. If this is the case, please let us know

Manuscript ID JAPAN-Oct-22-538 entitled "The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic" with Prof. Hossain as contact author has been submitted to the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition. Due to your expertise in this subject area, I would like to invite you to review this manuscript. The abstract appears at the end of this letter, along with the names of the author(s).

Please let me know within 7 days from the date of this invitation if you are able to accept the invitation to review by clicking the appropriate link at the bottom of the page to automatically register your reply. If you are unable to review at this time, I would appreciate you recommending another expert reviewer – please reply to this e-mail with your suggestion.

If you do not reply promptly to this invite, you will receive an automatically generated reminder of the invitation to review by email. If you do not respond to the invitation to review within 7 days of the date of the original invitation, we will assume that you do not wish/are unable to review the manuscript at this time.

Please consider whether you have any conflict(s) of interest that may have an impact on the impartiality of your review (including in relation to any Company and/or commercial product mentioned in the article). If your conflict is serious enough to preclude your participation you should decline this invitation to review. Please contact me or the Editorial Office ([JAPANedoffice@wiley.com](mailto:JAPANedoffice@wiley.com)) prior to accepting this invitation if you'd like to discuss what constitutes a serious conflict.

If you accept the invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail about how to access ScholarOne, our online manuscript submission and review system. You will then have access to the manuscript and reviewer instructions in your Reviewer Centre. The time for the review is 28 days.

By accepting an invitation to review with a Wiley journal, you agree to the Wiley Peer Review Policy here: <https://bit.ly/WileyReviewerPolicy>

I realize that our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and I thank you for your present and/or future participation.

Our reviewers now have the opportunity to opt-in to receive recognition for their review contributions at Publons.com. Publons allows you to track, verify and showcase your review work and expertise without compromising anonymity. You can read more about the Publons service at <https://publons.com/in/wiley/>.

Sincerely,

Dr. Jürgen Hummel  
Editor, Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition  
[jhummel@gwdg.de](mailto:jhummel@gwdg.de)

\*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.  
\*\*\*

Agreed: [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=e9ef70ee41db43ffa00101ff1d8b5e04](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=e9ef70ee41db43ffa00101ff1d8b5e04)

Declined: [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=a18394fe158f4bafb10de6ff0130f573](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=a18394fe158f4bafb10de6ff0130f573)

Late Response: [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=020d7b3c931443a6815dad283bf0923b](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=020d7b3c931443a6815dad283bf0923b)

No Response: [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=31bf33fd48a0439eb0a421d871965233](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=31bf33fd48a0439eb0a421d871965233)

Unavailable: [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=ac4f6485bd9d4b3bba5ca750686c8add](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=ac4f6485bd9d4b3bba5ca750686c8add)

## MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

TITLE: The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic

AUTHORS: Paul, Subrata; Prank, Md.; Tabassum, Mushfika; Sultan, Nahid; Islam, Shilpi; Hossain, Md

ABSTRACT: A cross-sectional survey was conducted during June 2021 to July 2022 in Bhangura upazila, Pabna, Bangladesh to explore the performance of eight different sub-types of Pabna cattle (PC). Results indicated that the mean birth weight, live weight, lactation length (LL), lactation yield (LY), average daily milk yield (ADMY), age at puberty (AP), age at first service (AFS), age at first conception (AFC) and dry period (DP) differed significantly ( $p < 0.01$ ) among the PC sub-types. Mean live weight of the highest milk yielding PC×JS75% was 1.32 times higher than the PC. The LL of PC×JS75% was  $305 \pm 1.6$  d which was 1.2 times higher than PC. The highest LY was recorded in PC×JS75% which was 2.2 times higher than the PC. Increased live weight and increased roughage supply substantially increased total milk yield. However, increased dry period, post-partum period and calving interval reduced milk yield. Calving interval, days open and age at 1st conception constituted highest eigenvectors controlling maximum variability in the milk yield. The earliest and most delay AP was recorded for PC×SN and PC×SL genotypes, respectively. The minimum and maximum DP was recorded for PC×JS75% and PC genotypes, respectively. The highest ADMY was recorded in PC×JS75% genotype, which was 1.9 times higher than the PC. Overall, increased body weight ( $p = 0.002$ ; OR=11.2) of the sub-types of PC with increased milk yield ( $p = 0.017$ ; OR=6.2) had the increased probability of lumpy skin disease. However, increased concentrate supply ( $p < 0.001$ ; OR=<1.0) substantially reduced probability of foot and mouth disease. It was concluded that the PC×JS75% consistently performed better under small-scale subsistence farming system.

By submitting a manuscript to or reviewing for this publication, your name, email address, and affiliation, and other contact details the publication might require, will be used for the regular operations of the publication, including sharing with the publisher (Wiley) and partners for production, publication and improvements to the authoring process. The publication and the publisher recognize the importance of protecting the personal information collected from users in the operation of these services, and have practices in place to ensure that steps are taken to maintain the security, integrity, and privacy of the personal data collected and processed. You can learn more at [www.wiley.com/privacy](http://www.wiley.com/privacy). In case you don't want to be contacted by this publication again, please send an email to [JAPANedoffice@wiley.com](mailto:JAPANedoffice@wiley.com).



asep ali &lt;asepali76@gmail.com&gt;

---

**Manuscript ID JAPAN-Oct-22-538 now in your Reviewer Center - Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition**

---

Jürgen Hummel <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>  
Reply-To: jhummel@gwdg.de  
To: asepali76@gmail.com

Sun, Nov 20, 2022 at 7:37 AM

19-Nov-2022

Dear Mr. Ali:

We recognise that the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic may affect your ability to return your review to us within the requested timeframe. If this is the case, please let us know

Thank you for agreeing to review Manuscript ID JAPAN-Oct-22-538 entitled "The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic" for the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition. Please try your best to complete your review within the next 28 days.

In your review, please answer all questions. On the review page, there is a space for "Comments to Editor" and a space for "Comments to the Author." Please be sure to put your comments to the author in the appropriate space.

To access the manuscript, login to the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition - Manuscript Central site at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan>. Your case-sensitive USER ID is [asepali76@gmail.com](mailto:asepali76@gmail.com) and your PASSWORD is [https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=e23703a203904f4e8dc72c04e0f826b1](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=e23703a203904f4e8dc72c04e0f826b1)

Please note that the single use link will expire on 23-Nov-2022 12:37:45 AM GMT / 22-Nov-2022 7:37:45 PM EST. If the single use link has expired, you can generate a single use password by entering your email address into the Password Help function on your site log in page: <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan>

To access the score sheet directly from this email you may click the link below.

[https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL\\_MASK=a65a6fced98b44fdbbbacb5f002b3689](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/japan?URL_MASK=a65a6fced98b44fdbbbacb5f002b3689)

Once you are logged in, the Home page will be displayed. Please click on the Review tab, where you will find the manuscript listed under "Review and Score". To begin reviewing the manuscript, select "Continue Review" in the "Action" drop down. You should check the "Files" tab as the author may have submitted files that are additional to the main submission, which may not be included in the HTML or PDF but that do require your review. Follow the instructions for reviewers provided on the Instructions tab. The review form auto-saves every 30 seconds. When you have completed your review and are ready to submit it to the Editor, click on "Submit Review." For reviewing tips and guidelines, visit <http://www.WileyPeerReview.com>.

Before undertaking a review, please read our review confidentiality policy at <http://www.wileypeerreview.com/reviewpolicy>.

All communications regarding this manuscript are privileged. Any conflict of interest, suspicion of duplicate publication, fabrication of data or plagiarism must immediately be reported to me.

During the review process, you will be given the opportunity to receive recognition for your review contribution on Publons.com. You can read more about opting in to the Publons services and how this benefits you at <https://publons.com/in/wiley/>.

Thank you for evaluating this manuscript.

Sincerely,

Dr. Jürgen Hummel  
Editor, Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition  
[jhummel@gwdg.de](mailto:jhummel@gwdg.de)

\*\*\*\*\*

If you have any questions during the peer review process, you can also contact the Editorial Office:  
[japanedoffice@wiley.com](mailto:japanedoffice@wiley.com)



asep ali &lt;asepali76@gmail.com&gt;

---

**Thank you for submitting your review of Manuscript ID JAPAN-Oct-22-538 for the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition**

---

**Jürgen Hummel** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>  
Reply-To: jhummel@gwdg.de  
To: asepali76@gmail.com

Wed, Nov 30, 2022 at 8:36 PM

30-Nov-2022

Dear Mr. Ali:

Thank you for reviewing manuscript # JAPAN-Oct-22-538 entitled "The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic" for the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition.

On behalf of the Editors of the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition, we appreciate the voluntary contribution that each reviewer gives to the Journal. We thank you for your participation in the online review process and hope that we may call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

If you are interested in the decision of the Editor, please log in to your account, locate the manuscript and view the decision letter.

Sincerely,  
Dr. Jürgen Hummel  
Editor, Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition  
[jhummel@gwdg.de](mailto:jhummel@gwdg.de)



asep ali &lt;asepali76@gmail.com&gt;

---

## Decision on Manuscript ID JAPAN-Oct-22-538 - Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition

---

Jürgen Hummel &lt;onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com&gt;

Sun, Jan 15, 2023 at 7:57 PM

Reply-To: jhummel@gwdg.de

To: jhummel@gwdg.de

Dear Reviewer,

Re JAPAN-Oct-22-538: The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic

Following receipt of the peer reviews (including yours), a decision was made on this manuscript submitted to Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition. The final decision and text of the decision letter are appended at the foot of this letter for your information.

May I take this opportunity to thank you for your valuable contribution to the journal.

With best wishes

Jürgen Hummel  
Editor, Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition

Decision on this article: Reject – Do Not Transfer

15-Jan-2023

Dear Prof. Hossain:

I write you in regards to manuscript # JAPAN-Oct-22-538 entitled "The PC×JS75% genotype produces consistently more milk under small-scale subsistence farming system in the tropic" which you submitted to the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition. Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition.

Your manuscript has been editorially reviewed, and unfortunately, it has been found unsuitable for publication. The manuscript is well prepared and the work done is appreciated. However, it does not reach the required level to be published since the novelty/ the scientific value is limited. Therefore, I would like to encourage you to submit this paper to a journal with a different context.

Thank you for considering the Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition for the publication of your research. I hope the outcome of this specific submission will not discourage you from the submission of future manuscripts.

Sincerely,  
Dr. Xugang Luo  
Co Editor In Chief, Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal Nutrition  
[wlysz@263.net](mailto:wlysz@263.net)

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author

This is an interesting study though it only investigated a little question; comparing which breed is better performance in a tropical area. The crossbreed with exotic genotypes from the temperate region was better than the tropical native that also reported by many previous studies. However, the methodological approach is interesting.

Page 2

L16: what is JS? Need an explanation in the first appearance

L26: SN and SL? Need an explanation in the first appearance

Abstract: comparison between crossbreeds could be more interesting?.

Page 3

L33: JR? JS (Jersey)

Page 4

L15-18: It is bordered on the north by Tarash .....the Upazila. Are the sentences not important to explain the location of the study?

L21-28: the genotype percentage. How to estimate the percentage? Need an explanation?. Mostly, At the small-scale farmer level, the breeding program is less managed (page 6 L53).

Page 5

L9: CVASU. Need an explanation for the first appearance?

Page 6

L44-52: Most of the farmers around 84% did not use commercial concentrate.... Sentences were repeated. Rephrase the sentences

L54-58: Rephrase the sentences?

Page 7

L6-17 & L20-33: these paragraphs are lengthy. Comparison between the highest and the lowest or crossbreed and native could be more interesting.

L39 increased dry period or days open?

L41 Figure 2-4 or Figure 2?

L41-44: "Calving interval, days open and age at 1st conception constituted highest eigenvectors controlling maximum variability in the milk yield" ? figure 5: Calving interval, age at puberty, postpartum period have highest eigenvectors??

Page 8

L22-37: effects of genotype & parity. The paragraphs discuss productive performances. They could be joined to productive performances (Page 7 L46)

Figure 3. Does it explain something in the Results chapter?

The abbreviation is used in many parts. The abbreviation is not needed if used once.

L50-60. Marketing of milk is out of the scope of JAPAN

Page 10

The abbreviation is used in many parts. The abbreviation is not needed if used once.

L38. L×F, L×F×F, L×SL and L×S?

BCS?

Page 10 -13 L31

The discussion only compared the value in the present study with the values in the previous studies. However, there are no conclusive reasons for the differences.

Page 13

L37-55: higher milk yield of Bos Taurus genotypes than native tropical breeds.

How about the comparison between crossbreeds?

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author

The focus of this manuscript is clearly NOT on animal nutrition and physiology, but on dairy production and genetics. Thus the manuscript does not classify for the selected Journal of Animal Nutrition and Animal Physiology.

The major problem of the manuscript is its extremely short and incomplete description on how the data, especially on animal performance and animal genetics, was collected. The authors claim that the interviewed farmers were selected at random, but then they produce a long list of criteria that an interviewed farmer must fulfil - this contradicts a random sampling.

Moreover, in the statistics part, it is unclear which variables are analysed with which methods, because data from 47 farms are rather not all parametric.

Some of the figures shown in the manuscript are not fully described in the subtitles, are erroneous, or are depicted in an incomprehensible manner.

In its present stage, the manuscript clearly has major deficits which should be straightened out before submitting it to a journal that also fits its contents.

In the revised pdf file that is submitted with this assessment, the authors find some suggestions on how they might probably improve parts of the manuscript; as the manuscript does not converge with the aims and scopes of the Journal of Animal Nutrition and Animal Physiology, detailed correction was not carried out for the entire text.



WILEY

# Reviewer Certificate

This certificate is awarded to

**ASEP ALI**

for serving as a reviewer for

**Journal of Animal Physiology and Animal  
Nutrition**



**Thank you for reviewing 1 manuscript in 2022**

23 April 2023  
**Date**

Prof. Xugang Luo and Dr. Stefanie  
Handl  
**Co-Editors-in-Chief**