

REVIEW FORUM Reviewer Need Help

- ✓ 1. Initial Validation
- ✓ 2. Editorial Assignment
- ✓ 3. Independent Review
- ✓ 4. Interactive Review
- ✓ 5. Review Finalized
- 6. Final Validation
- 7. ...

An exploratory view on the relationship between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate

Hossein Masoumi Karakani*, Sollie Millard and Frans Kanfer

Original Research, *Front. Public Health - Infectious Diseases - Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment*

Received on: 25 Aug 2021, Edited by: Andree Kurniawan

Manuscript ID: 763765

Keywords: COVID-19, Meteorological factors, infection rate, Piecewise regression model, South Africa

- Download latest
- View submitted files history

Iche Liberty
Iche.aliberty@gmail.com

- Profile
- Settings & Privacy
- Help Center
- Logout

NO ACTION IS REQUIRED FROM YOU

This manuscript has been rejected.

History Editor (Active) Reviewer 1 (Rejected) Reviewer 2 (Active) Reviewer 3 (Active) Me (Finalized)

MANUSCRIPT This report was last updated on: 21 Jan 2022-10:31 GMT
For more information about this page, please [Click here](#)

Repeat submission (Duplicates) CHECKED

07 Oct 2021-20:17 GMT

I am checking the current submission against existing articles in our database.

Frontiers manuscript matches CHECKED

AIRA 07 Oct 2021-20:17 GMT

I did not detect similarities with any other manuscript submitted to Frontiers.

- Compose
- Inbox 1,547
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts 106
- Categories
- Social 657
- Updates 1,070
- Forums
- Promotions 811
- Personal
- More

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

- Hangouts
- iche.a +

Invitation to Review a Manuscript

Andree Kurniawan (Via FrontiersIn) <noreply@frontiersin.org> Unsubscribe
to lche

Fri, Sep 24, 2021, 10:26 AM

Dear Dr lche Andriyani Liberty,

I am writing to ask whether you would be able to review the manuscript "Carnitine and COVID-19 Susceptibility and Severity: A Mendelian Randomization Study", by Huifang Shang, Chunyu Li, Ruwei Ou and Qianqian Wei, submitted for consideration in Frontiers in Nutrition, section Clinical Nutrition.

Please read below for details concerning the submission and inform us of your interest using the hyperlinks enclosed. In agreeing to review this manuscript, we trust that its subject matter falls within your area of expertise and that you are available to review the paper within 7 days. Before accepting this invitation, verify whether you have any potential conflicts of interest with the authors, including past collaborations or shared affiliation (see policy at <https://www.frontiersin.org/about/review-system#EditorialPolicies>).

Please note that should you participate in the review process and endorse publication of the paper, you are agreeing to the disclosure of your name on the published article. You may read below for more information. It is also important that you familiarize yourself with the Frontiers Collaborative Review Guidelines, accessible at https://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?a=1320&name=clinical_nutrition. Briefly, the Frontiers review mandate is to evaluate the manuscript based on objective criteria, including the validity and rigor of the work.

To ACCEPT this review invitation, please click on the link below. If you are not registered with Frontiers yet, you will be first asked to register. <https://www.frontiersin.org/journal/acceptInvitation.aspx?acceptInvitationNo=ca0386cd-114b-4cda-8656-d423d1faa676>

To DECLINE this review invitation, preventing further reminders, please click on the link below: <https://www.frontiersin.org/review/declinelInvitation.aspx?dren=ca0386cd-114b-4cda-8656-d423d1faa676>

Thank you for considering to review this manuscript.

With best regards,

Andree Kurniawan
Guest Associate Editor, Frontiers in Nutrition
<https://www.frontiersin.org/>

-----MANUSCRIPT DETAILS-----
Journal: Frontiers in Nutrition, section Clinical Nutrition
Article type: Brief Research Report
Manuscript title: Carnitine and COVID-19 Susceptibility and Severity: A Mendelian Randomization Study
Manuscript ID: 780205
Authors: Huifang Shang, Chunyu Li, Ruwei Ou and Qianqian Wei
Submitted on: 20 Sep 2021
Edited by: Andree Kurniawan
Research Topic: Dyslipidemia, Obesity and Coronavirus Disease 2019 (Covid-19)

Abstract: Background: Carnitine, a potential substitute or supplementation for dexamethasone, might protect against COVID-19 based on its molecular functions. However, the correlation between carnitine and COVID-19 has not been explored yet, and whether there exists causation is unknown. Methods: A two-sample Mendelian randomization (MR) analysis was conducted to explore the causal relationship between carnitine level and COVID-19. Significant single nucleotide polymorphisms from genome-wide association study on carnitine (N = 7,824) were utilized as exposure instruments, and summary statistics of the susceptibility (N = 1,467,264), severity (N = 714,592) and hospitalization (N = 1,887,658) of COVID-19 were utilized as the outcome. The causal relationship was evaluated by multiplicative random effects inverse variance weighted (IVW) method, and further verified by another three MR methods including MR Egger, weighted median, and weighted mode, as well as extensive sensitivity analyses. Results: Genetically determined one standard deviation increase in carnitine amount was associated with lower susceptibility (OR: 0.38, 95% CI: 0.19-0.74, P: 4.77E-03) of COVID-19. Carnitine amount was also associated with lower severity and hospitalization of COVID-19 using another three MR methods, though the association was not significant using the IVW method but showed the same direction of effect. The results were robust under all sensitivity analyses. Conclusions: A genetic predisposition to high carnitine levels might reduce the susceptibility and severity of COVID-19. These results provide better understandings on the role of carnitine in the COVID-19 pathogenesis, and facilitate novel therapeutic targets for COVID-19 in future clinical trials.

No Hangouts contacts
[Find someone](#)

Conclusions: A genetic predisposition to high carnitine levels might reduce the susceptibility and severity of COVID-19. These results provide better understandings on the role of carnitine in the COVID-19 pathogenesis, and facilitate novel therapeutic targets for COVID-19 in future clinical trials.

Frontiers Review Guidelines

The Frontiers peer-review is a collaborative process with a focus on objective criteria, efficiency and transparency. A review questionnaire is provided in the online review forum to assist you in reviewing the manuscript. Reviewers identities are revealed at the end of the review process and you will be acknowledged for your work and contribution on the publication. Please note that you will remain anonymous throughout the entire review process. If irresolvable conflicts arise you may choose to withdraw from the review process and in such case you will remain anonymous. However, if the paper gets accepted for publication and no conflicts arose that led to your withdrawal, your contribution will be acknowledged on the publication.

The Frontiers review process has unique features, including an interactive review stage, and a focus on objective criteria. To ensure an efficient review process please familiarize yourself with the Frontiers review guidelines: https://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?s=1320&name=clinical_nutrition

Reviewers are obliged to keep all manuscript files confidential and to delete all records after completing the review process. The review reports are also confidential and may only be shared with the authors and the handling editor of the manuscript in the review forum. Posting of the review report publicly is prohibited.

If you do not want to receive any updates from Frontiers, you can unsubscribe by forwarding your request to support@frontiersin.org

[Unsubscribe](#) | [Email Preferences](#)

Reply

Forward



No Hangouts contacts
[Find someone](#)



>

- Compose
- Inbox 1,548
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts 106
- Categories
- Social 657
- Updates 1,071
- Forums
- Promotions 811
- Personal
- More

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

- Hangouts
- iche.a +



No Hangouts contacts
[Find someone](#)

Your action needed: please respond to the authors or finalize your review - 763765

Frontiers in Public Health Editorial Office <publichealth.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
to lche

Wed, Oct 13, 2021, 2:47 PM

Dear Dr Liberty,

This is a kind reminder to let you know that your further comments or final review is needed for the manuscript you are reviewing:
An exploratory view on the relationship between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate
<http://review.frontiersin.org/review/763765/0/0>
Please take action in the Review Forum **as soon as possible**. Should you require more time to submit your feedback, please reply to this email to get in touch with the Editorial Office.
The handling editor looks forward to receiving your expert feedback on this manuscript.

With best regards,
Your Frontiers in Public Health team
Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland
Office T 0041 215 10 17 91

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

-----MANUSCRIPT DETAILS-----
Manuscript title: An exploratory view on the relationship between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate
Manuscript ID: 763765
Authors: Hossein Masoumi Karakani, Sollie Millard and Frans Kanfer
Journal: Frontiers in Public Health, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Research topic: None
Submitted on: 24 Aug 2021

You are receiving this email regarding ongoing activities you have with Frontiers. If you think this was wrongly sent to you, please contact our support team at support@frontiersin.org

Reply Forward

- Compose
- Inbox 1,547
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts 106
- Categories
- Social 657
- Updates 1,070
- Forums
- Promotions 811
- Personal
- More

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

- Hangouts
- iche.a +

No Hangouts contacts
[Find someone](#)

Frontiers: Authors have replied to you: action needed

Frontiers Public Health Editorial Office <publichealth.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
to lche.a

Dear Dr Liberty,
Frontiers Public Health Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

We would like to follow-up on our previous email, as the authors of the manuscript "An exploratory view on the relationship between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate" have recently responded in the review forum. If you think that the authors' replies have addressed your comments and concerns satisfactorily, please click on "Endorse publication".

If you think that your concerns were not sufficiently addressed, please let the authors know by posting further comments. Alternatively, should you not think that the manuscript can be adequately revised or do not wish to take further part in the discussion, please click on "Withdraw from review/Recommend rejection".

Please take action in the discussion forum in the next three days. The forum is designed to allow more than one round of comments and replies, where appropriate, and comments are visible to all participants.

To view the manuscript and respond to the authors, please click on the following link:
<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=90d289d-3218-4046-826b-4ad1ab0b9f65>

Should you require more time to submit your feedback, please do let us know by clicking on "Request Extension" on the review forum.

Thank you very much for your expert contribution to the review of this manuscript. Please contact us if you need additional time to address the authors' responses.

With best regards,

Your Frontiers in Public Health team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland
Office T 0041 215 10 17 91

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: An exploratory view on the relationship between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate
Manuscript ID: 763765
Journal: Frontiers in Public Health, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Authors: Hossein Masoumi Karakani, Sollie Millard, Frans Kanfer

Reply Forward

- Compose
- Inbox 1,548
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts 106
- Categories
- Social 657
- Updates 1,071
- Forums
- Promotions 811
- Personal
- More

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

- Hangouts
- iche.a +



No Hangouts contacts
[Find someone](#)

Frontiers: Thank you for submitting your Independent Review Report! - 763765

Frontiers Public Health Editorial Office <publichealth.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
to lche.a liberty

Dear Dr Liberty,
Frontiers Public Health Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

Thank you for submitting your independent review report for the manuscript "An exploratory view on the association between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate ". The handling editor has been notified, and you can find a copy of your report below.

You will be informed once the interactive review process is activated, to allow direct discussion with the authors. Until this next stage, you can still modify your report if you have any outstanding comments. You can access your report and the manuscript online using the following link:
<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=7271b4cd-b9b5-4c0a-ab12-e0578d7be478&retab=4>

To familiarize yourself further with the Frontiers review guidelines:
http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?s=1762&name=infectious_diseases_-_surveillance_prevention_and_treatment

With best regards,

Your Frontiers in Public Health team
Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland
Office T 0041 215 10 17 91

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: An exploratory view on the association between weather patterns and the South African 14-day COVID-19 infection rate
Manuscript ID: 763765
Authors: Hossein Masoumi Karakani, Sollie Millard, Frans Kanfer
Journal: Frontiers in Public Health, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Submitted on: 24 Aug 2021
Edited by: Andree Kurniawan

Independent Review Report, Reviewer: lche Liberty

EVALUATION
Please list your revision requests for the authors and provide your detailed comments, including highlighting limitations and strengths of the study and evaluating the validity of the methods, results, and data interpretation. If you have additional comments based on Q2 and Q3 you can add them as well.

1. There is no research design for the method in this article. Is this an ecological study?
2. The term association is very different from correlation in epidemiological studies. For this study, it would be more appropriate to use correlation, not association
3. What is mean by high statistical results, R2 values for JHB, PTA, and CPT are 0.905, 0.907, and 0.920, respectively. More references are needed to explain why statistical analysis gives this result when this factor is marginal. The number of references used is less.
4. It is necessary to explain what local policies have been carried out by the government related to the handling of the COVID-19 pandemic at the research location to provide further explanation related to policies which of course also affect the daily infection rate. Then it would be better if the number of tracing ratios and testing achievements in the last 14 days at the research site were explained. And how and how the positive cases were treated.